

MARINA COAST WATER DISTRICT

2017 Rate Study and Cost Allocation Plan Proposal Matrix

Firm	Locale	Qualification of Firm	# of Personnel	Related Experience	References	Completeness of Response/Ability to Understand District's Needs	Reasonableness of Cost and Price
Carollo Engineers	Walnut Creek, CA	Engineering firm established in 1933 (84 years) and have provided financial services to utilities nationally and throughout CA for over 30 years.	4	Provided financial planning services for over 300 utilities in CA over past 5 years including MCWD. Over 30 water rate studies over the past 2 years.	References were verified and gave high recommendations. Board workshops were run in a learning environment for the District and the Public.	Response was complete. Carollo has unique understanding of the District as the previous rate study consultant and has provided numerous engineering studies for the District including the design of the RUWAP. Will tailor rate model and revenue calculators to the District.	496 hours = \$98,548 (includes \$5,800 Overhead and \$2,500 estimated for travel for in-District meetings)
Domain Experts Consultants (DEC)	Santa Clara, CA	15+ years	3	Most of experience listed is in the area of cost allocation. Primary staff working on the project with DEC since 2016	Was unable to reach listed references.	Response was complete.	628 hours = \$68,620
HF&H Consultants, LLC	Walnut Creek, CA	Consulting firm began in 1989 (28 years). Principal was the author of Chapter 11 of the Water Environment Federation's Manual of Practice 27 - Financing and Charges for Wastewater Systems	4	Has provided multiple rate studies to 27 CA public entities over the past 10 years.	References were not verified due to incomplete response.	Proposal for rate study only - no cost allocation plan proposal was submitted.	387 hours = \$84,520 (includes \$1,000 for miscellaneous expenses)
Lechowicz & Tseng Municipal Consultants	Oakland, CA	LLC formed just 3 months ago however the partners of the firm have a combined 20 years experience in municipal consulting	2	Staff experience indicates 14 rate studies financial plans conducted throughout their career	References were not verified due to incomplete response.	Did not submit a cost proposal which was a requirement of the RFP	Will Provide a cost proposal upon request
NBS	Davis, CA	Firm was formed in 1996 (21 years). Published 2 books on related industry topics including "The Rates, Fees and Charges Compendium"	5	Project Manager has 35 years in the field and has completed over 300 studies over the years.	Received a local reference verification. Very highly recommended.	Response was complete. Rate models will be custom built to suit the District's needs.	506 hours = \$90,375 (\$4,355 estimated for reimbursable expenses)
Raftelis Financial Consultants, Inc.	Oakland, CA	Firm founded in 1993 (24 years) with local and national experience. Co-authored many of the industry's leading guidebooks regarding wastewater and water financial issues and rate setting.	6	The Principal on the project has conducted more than 200 water, wastewater, and recycled water studies. Project Manager has over 20 years experience in public sector consulting.	References were verified and gave high recommendations. Board workshops were run in a very professional manner and successfully got governing bodies to "own" the results of the study.	Response was complete. Rate models will be custom built to suit the District's needs.	980 hours = \$199,946 (includes \$9,800 Overhead and \$1,446 estimated travel for in-District meetings)
Stantec (formerly MWH)	Walnut Creek, CA	Stantec is a global firm out of Canada. Merged with MWH in 2016.	5	Project Manager has had articles published by AWWA Journal addressing the legal challenges of water pricing in CA.	Received a local reference verification. Would contract with Stantec again if they had the same Project Manager. Rates are being challenged and firm is standing with the District and providing ongoing support.	Response was complete. Rate models will be custom built to suit the District's needs but considered proprietary and District will have to sign a usage and nondisclosure statement.	668 hours = \$139,114 (includes \$6,077 estimated direct expense with a 10% mark-up)
Willdan Financial Services	San Francisco, CA	Established in 1988 (29 years) with local and national experience.	4	Willdan staff are involved with the development of AWWA M-1 and M-29 manuals. Staff on project has over 30 years experience.	Only able to reach one reference who gave a high recommendation. Staff was easy to work with but could not speak to the ease of use of the rate model because they did not request one.	Response was complete. Rate models will be custom built to suit the District's needs.	400 hours = \$79,130 (includes estimated expenses of \$7,500)